Ethical Leadership Development as Care of the Self

A Foucauldian Perspective*

FRANK PIGNATELLI
Bank Street College of Education, New York

Michel Foucault has made an important contribution to our understanding of how power operates in modern societies. Yet the work he did in the later stages of his life around the ethical context of power and leadership has not been given the same attention. Foucault contends that his preoccupation with describing and analyzing relations of power operating in and across social institutions should be situated explicitly in an ethical context. It is an ethical context that takes as its starting point the self's relationship to itself. Foucault imagines ethics as care of oneself rooted in ongoing practices a person commits to and cultivates over time. I propose that care of the self provides a vital framework for the training and development of educational leaders. I begin by examining how these ethical considerations emerge from Foucault's analysis of power and consider how ethics as care of the self speaks to the development of educational leadership.

The Power/Ethics Axis

Foucault takes pains to indicate that when he speaks about relations of power, this is not to be equated with ongoing states of domination. Power is not a commodity. It is neither possessed nor exchanged. "Power . . . only exists in action" (Foucault 1980, 89). Relations of power are "changeable, reversible and unstable" (123). It is Foucault's contention that power is not, in itself, good or evil, that it is, in fact, built into the very fiber of all human

*Thanks to Alisa Algava, who helped in the collection of the interview data.

Schools: Studies in Education, vol. 12, no. 2 (Fall 2015).
© 2015 Francis W. Parker School, Chicago. All rights reserved. 1550-1175/2015/1202-0003$10.00

This content downloaded from 198.082.230.035 on October 13, 2017 13:28:11 PM
All use subject to University of Chicago Press Terms and Conditions (http://www.journals.uchicago.edu/t-and-c).

relations. Nonetheless, the inescapability of exercising power through the actions we take enlarges the surface of doing harm. One must be alert to the dangers as well as the possibilities that present themselves, vigilant to what actions are not only possible but also ethically warranted and respectful of the other's freedom. The inevitability of the asymmetrical nature of these relations is neither wished away nor bracketed out by an a priori assumption about the nature of man existing outside of the turbulence, challenges, and opportunities that present themselves in one's present situation. The asymmetry that exists in these relations of power, however, is not equated with static positions of domination. For where there is power, there is also freedom. The play of power is neither frozen nor inevitable. Foucault goes on to explain: "If there were no possibility of resistance, of escape, of ruse, of strategies that reverse the situation—there would be no relations of power" (123).

This dynamic of relations of power and freedom has important moral implications. Joyce J. Schuld's (2003) take on Foucault frames what is at stake: "For [Foucault], the central moral issue is whether and how [these relations of power] allow interactive fluidity and reversibility so that renewing social energies can transfigure historically established problems, *especially those that encourage the instrumental use of persons*" (43; emphasis added).

The uncertain and shifting nature of this power-freedom dynamic ought to heighten our awareness of how we conduct ourselves as ethical subjects. Contingent moves trump wholesale reversals. Patience and care must be cultivated as one formulates acts of resistance targeted to address specific situations. An awareness of the other's vulnerability, the enactment of sympathetic understanding of the anticipated consequences of possible acts, will also matter. This is complex, nuanced work. Foucault proposes that individuals submit to a set of practices designed to cultivate one's ethical conduct and fortify one's resolve to exercise agency in the midst of the ebb and flow of power, practices intended to support an ethical subject's capacity to avoid the undertow of desires and habits that erode the capacity to "master the appetites that risk engulfing you" (Foucault 1987, 116).

Caring for Oneself/Caring for Others

But why this turn toward matters not immediately situated amidst social institutions such as schools? Why this turn toward the personal and private? Toward a way of framing ethical matters that advocates for the cultivation of self-mastery as a way to strengthen resolve, to maintain a sense of purpose and control in the midst of the turbulence of a life full of dangers and threats to one's freedom?

This content downloaded from 198.082.230.035 on October 13, 2017 13:28:11 PM
All use subject to University of Chicago Press Terms and Conditions (http://www.journals.uchicago.edu/t-and-c).

Foucault's response to these questions draws upon Plato's *Alcibiades* to underscore the crucial relationship between an individual's ability to govern himself and how this will bear upon his readiness and ability to enter public life and assume a leadership role. Alcibiades, we are told, is an ambitious young man who desires to enter public life and govern the conduct of others, but he is deemed woefully unprepared by Socrates. He has not, in Socrates's view, cared for himself sufficiently. Foucault (1988) explains what this would entail: "Concern for self . . . expresses something much more serious than paying attention. . . . It is always a real activity and not just an attitude" (24). As depicted in Greek and Roman texts of the time, Foucault reminds us, caring for the self is not viewed as an indication of self-indulgence. Alcibiades needs guidance, a *pedagogical* intervention centered on how to properly care for himself. He needs to commit to and enact a set of self-governing practices as a way of cultivating this care. These modes of engagement create a path to self-knowledge. They constitute a practice of self-governing intended to prepare an individual for a life of public service and the ethical governance of others.

Thus, one cares for oneself by means of a set of specific practices intended to enhance knowledge of oneself. These practices enable an ethical subject to refashion himself as he attempts to exercise his freedom and confront the forces intent on limiting and defining him. This is akin to modes of practice undertaken by artists or athletes committed to perfecting their craft as they submit to a series of prescribed routines, actions repeated over time intended to strengthen and build confidence and performative capacity. It is a discipline one takes on in order to break through familiar patterns of conduct, embedded habits, and set ways of perceiving what is possible that hold an individual back. Not intended as an end in itself, it is a set of practices one cultivates over time. Foucault (2005) puts it this way: "The care of oneself . . . is a principle of restlessness and movement, of continuous concern throughout life. . . . [E]pimeliea heautou (care of the self) is indeed the justificatory framework, ground, and foundation for the imperative 'know yourself'"(8). These practices by which an ethical subject discovers the truth about himself constitute an ethical domain. Foucault emphasizes that caring for oneself is *the enactment of these truths* in contested spaces, not just the awareness of them. Power and ethics are entwined, inseparable. An ethical subject, while situated in a field of power, remains open to refashioning. "He can cultivate the ability," as Foucault (as cited in Brion and Harcourt 2014) puts it, "to loosen one's hold on oneself" (5). If we understand how our selves came to be the way they are, our truth,

This content downloaded from 198.082.230.035 on October 13, 2017 13:28:11 PM
All use subject to University of Chicago Press Terms and Conditions (http://www.journals.uchicago.edu/t-and-c).

we give ourselves a chance to be what we not yet are. The work of ethics, for Foucault, involves the self's encounter with itself in the service of aligning its conduct with moral principles. It involves cultivating a way of engaging with or interrogating oneself to be more equipped to exercise moral agency.

Ethical Educational Leadership Development and Matters of School Accountability

But what might this way of understanding the intersecting axes of power, knowledge, and ethics as caring for oneself have to do with the preparation of school leaders and, specifically, their capacity to be ethical leaders?

Leadership in schools operates within a network of relations of power that risk eclipsing agency. If, as Foucault argues, power is ubiquitous, if it penetrates to the most intimate realms of one's self, if it moves silently and anonymously across private and public spheres, how is it possible to resist, to move against the grain? Or even assume responsibility for harm inflicted on others? In such a situation, "lines of guilt and innocence are intolerably blurred, threatening our moral potency and our clear-cut responsibility. . . . Human agency is stretched thin over a vast social space and time" (Schuld 2003, 59–60). When relations of power freeze up, leading to coercion and intimidation, who is to blame? Following Foucault, a leader cannot remove himself from the field of relations of power that shapes habits, desires, attitudes, and patterns of behavior, but neither is a leader forever trapped in a nameless, determinative system without some options at his disposal and some degree of responsibility for his actions. A leader has no choice but to shape a response in the very midst of the conditions that threaten to fix and confine him and others. The ubiquity of power does not absolve a leader from ethical conduct. The challenge, as Foucault (1987) sees it, is to "allow these games of power to be played with a minimum of domination" (129).

Currently, mainstream reform efforts center predominantly around a neoliberal agenda. Competition, particularly given concerns about what it takes to thrive in a globalized economy, plays a crucial role in defining the well-being of an individual and a society. So-called bottom-line markers of what passes for progress are designed to conform to quantitative sorting and ranking assessments that determine the viability of an educator's worth and a school's existence. A strong focus on results is unquestioningly coupled with the diminishing value placed upon process. Accountability is prescribed and set outside the individual's relation to himself, beyond the realm of those

This content downloaded from 198.082.230.035 on October 13, 2017 13:28:11 PM
All use subject to University of Chicago Press Terms and Conditions (http://www.journals.uchicago.edu/t-and-c).

people to whom he is directly, immediately responsible. Self-knowledge derived from how one is able to care for oneself, as a necessary component in the leading of others, risks being eclipsed and plays a greatly diminished role.

Those of us responsible for preparing school leaders need to be aware of, sometimes suggest, and often advocate for practices that foster a care of the self and, more specifically, a caring of the self ever mindful of how this caring prepares and nourishes leadership. We need to know what it means and what it takes to guide the "work of the self on the self" of an ethical subject as he strives to be, as Foucault put it, "good, beautiful, honorable, estimable, memorable and exemplary" (Foucault 1987, 117), qualities that lie at the core of ethical leadership.

"[Socrates] . . . is the person," Foucault reminds us, "who guides the others towards the care of themselves, and maybe towards the possibility of taking care of others" (2005, 152). Foucault's contribution to leadership preparation is to reignite a Socratic pedagogy in the interest of enhancing an educational leader's ethical conduct. He helps us see that moral potency is nourished by a leader's self-knowledge, a self-knowledge tested and shaped by self-governing practices. He challenges those of us committed to preparing educators mindful of their role as ethical leaders with figuring out with our students what kinds of self-caring practice constitute the work someone desirous of leading others could commit to.

A Promising Framework for Ethical Leadership Development

What, then, are some of the ways this work can be conducted? What practices available to an educational leader might be ways of caring for oneself? And how might these practices be a way of preparing and fortifying oneself for the daunting challenge of leadership at this time?

Foucault had little to say about the kinds of actual practices he believed warrant our attention at this present moment in time. In so doing, he resists being prescriptive. One practice that he does present and set in cultural-historical contexts, however, is writing. Focusing, for example, on Greco-Roman concerns during first century and second century A.D. about how one should properly conduct oneself, Foucault traces different ways writing was employed: writing to oneself as a form of self-examination, correspondence with others with the intent of helping the reader (a process that also helps the writer in fashioning his own conduct), and writing down quotations from books held in esteem intended to jog the memory for actual use in times of need in order to figure out how one should act. Writing, conceived as a deliberate, ongoing practice, was intended "to capture the

This content downloaded from 198.082.230.035 on October 13, 2017 13:28:11 PM
All use subject to University of Chicago Press Terms and Conditions (http://www.journals.uchicago.edu/t-and-c).

already said, to collect what one has managed to hear and read, and for a purpose that is nothing less than the shaping of the self" (1997, 211). The implications here for developing a sustained commitment to journal writing in the service of preparing someone to be an ethical leader is obvious. This has been a long-standing requirement in our leadership program. It serves as an integral part of the advisement program. But I was curious to know what other practices were or could be employed by students as they prepared for or took on leadership responsibilities.

A starting framework for such a pedagogy of care rooted in the analysis of Foucault's ethical turn I provide above is suggested in interview data a colleague and I have gathered from recently graduated leadership students in a master's degree program at my college. These data were gathered in the form of written responses and phone or face-to-face interviews. I told each informant that I was interested in understanding how a prospective or beginning educational leader "cared for her/himself" and in the process supports, informs, and energizes his or her capacity/readiness/growth as a leader. I told the informants that I was thinking of the kinds of practices or acts they strive to do on a regular basis that express how they care for themselves. I assured them that all names would be changed.

The data were organized under three categories: (i) letting go, caring for oneself as a mode of disengagement; (ii) finding what works and sustaining the practice of caring for oneself; and (iii) designing projects and creating spaces for the development of educational leaders that support care of the self.

Letting Go, Caring for Oneself as a Mode of Disengagement

Working with leadership students needs to include helping developing leaders recognize when it is necessary to compartmentalize and draw clear boundaries between one's professional and personal commitments as a way of caring for oneself. Barbara is an intense, ambitious, newly appointed assistant principal. While energized by and deeply committed to her new responsibilities, she recognizes the toll her work is taking on her and the challenge of what it means to care for herself:

> The biggest thing to figure out is how do you let the work stuff go. How do you really leave work and be with your family, be with your friends, be with yourself, be in your apartment, be in your home, and then how do you really leave it behind when you care so much about it. . . . I had this argument with a friend recently about identifying

This content downloaded from 198.082.230.035 on October 13, 2017 13:28:11 PM
All use subject to University of Chicago Press Terms and Conditions (http://www.journals.uchicago.edu/t-and-c).

> with one's work and that it's not healthy. But I love my work. It's part of who I am and to pretend it's not, that's not fully me then.

Pat spent a few years in her role as an assistant principal and then worked for the central board in a large city for a year as a leadership coach, visiting principals and advising them on a new, high-stakes teacher accountability initiative. This required extensive traveling across the city, a hectic schedule, and working with a wide range of situations. She worked with as many as 20 principals at the same time. When asked about how she manages to care for herself, Pat talked about the "closing of one world and stepping into another, [as] a daily practice that motivates and energizes me so I can return to school feeling calm and ready for what's ahead."

Carolynn, an aspiring leader, identifies herself as an educator guided by convictions rooted in social justice. She is articulate and clear about why she decided to work in public education in a community that is underserved. The work is intense and demanding on a daily basis. After a year of being a leadership intern at her school, shifting to the third person singular voice but rooted in her own struggles to find some balance in her life, Carolynn "believe[s] that people need to take a break from the work and do other things that they enjoy. No work on weekends!!! (as much as possible)." Then Carolynn got specific and addressed how she thinks about caring for herself and why it matters: "I find that activities that require a presence of mind are extremely important. In the fast-paced world of schools, it is rare to have a moment where your mind is not thinking about what happened that day or the next thing you must do, etc. Activities like yoga, live music, or hiking require a focus on the here and now in a way that other activities do not. *They allow you to stop thinking about work, but provide mental/physical stimulation in its place* (emphasis added)."

The self-discipline required to disengage—or, as Foucault put it "to loosen one's hold on oneself"—appears to be an essential aspect of caring for oneself in these promising educators. Work, school, and family pressures can coalesce into accumulated stress and a diffuse, heavy feeling of unease. Bob, for example, said: "I was in a place I didn't want to be." He turned to yoga "as a way to slow everything down. Yoga," as he sees it, "is a growth mind-set. Respect where you are, acceptance, don't judge [yourself]. Realizing you can change and become more." Listening to music also worked for Bob, but he was specific with what that means to him. He preferred melody, not lyrics, "as a way to detach from normal everyday stuff." Similarly, Pat stated that she practiced meditation because it "enables us to breathe through the mun-

This content downloaded from 198.082.230.035 on October 13, 2017 13:28:11 PM
All use subject to University of Chicago Press Terms and Conditions (http://www.journals.uchicago.edu/t-and-c).

dane, annoying activities, to find silence and calm and a sense of being suspended in time."

Finding What Works and Sustaining the Practice of Caring for Oneself

What also came out in the data is that there is no one best way to practice how to care for oneself. Barbara mentioned that she tried a few ways to care for herself: meditation, yoga, running, and talking with a friend. Samantha, once an aspiring academic with a doctorate in political philosophy from an Ivy League school, changed direction and now works in a progressive public high school. Now a newly appointed assistant principal with a strong, well-articulated social justice commitment, she spoke about a blend of the practices she commits to on a regular basis. In addition to yoga, she stated: "Writing things down has worked really well so far for envisioning. It hasn't worked as well for processing. And I think that's because I find it really useful to talk to other people to figure things out." Bob, on the other hand, believed that, as he put it, "talking can cloud issues." While Bob appreciated the kinesthetic aspect of yoga, he emphasized the opportunity yoga offered to be introspective. To further assure his commitment to a yoga practice, he hired a personal yoga trainer a few times a week during the school year.

When I asked Jenny how she cared for herself in the midst of a stressful time in her life, one of the things she mentioned was "ordering in dinner more often than normal." And what she described as "a silly pre-bed routine . . . saying three good things that happened to me that day." While such acts may seem small and modest in terms of one's active engagement in caring for oneself, they are not trivial. Clustered with other decisions, these kinds of everyday practices are placeholders or, better, reminders, of the ways one can exercise and affirm one's agency in the service of caring for oneself. During her internship year, Jenny struggled with coming to terms with both past and present professional decisions she had made. She hungered to use what she had believed in as a progressive teacher both in her own classroom and with her work with colleagues, but she constantly ran up against policies and practices that valued standardized curriculum and staff development that aligned too strictly for her tastes with a uniform core curriculum promulgated by central board dictates. She even volunteered to teach a high-stakes testing grade in her first year in her present school to understand at close range how standardized testing and forms of teacher and student accountability operate. As Jenny's advisor for her

This content downloaded from 198.082.230.035 on October 13, 2017 13:28:11 PM
All use subject to University of Chicago Press Terms and Conditions (http://www.journals.uchicago.edu/t-and-c).

internship year and someone who visited her school on a monthly basis, I came to understand that this decision was not taken lightly or cavalierly. She deliberately did not take the path of least resistance in opting to teach a testing grade. Her decision exemplifies the sense of purpose Jenny brought to her work to create meaningful learning opportunities for students in the midst of such demands and pressures. "Ambitious," "energetic," "a lively supple thinker about matters of practice" come to mind when I think of Jenny. I grew to admire and respect her capacity to peel back the onion and reflect upon both her thinking and feelings while struggling through a tough year. Through Jenny I came to understand the role forgiveness plays in striving to sustain a practice of caring for oneself. "I was honest about my limitations with students and family. I told my family ahead of time that I might not be as present because of work, and would tell my students I was tired because of [my graduate school responsibilities] and forgave myself (or at least tried to)."

Closely aligned to forgiving oneself is learning how to deal with one's vulnerability. This is not so much about failing to live up to one's expectations but dealing with what in hindsight were regrets, misgivings—decisions one would, if one could, take back and do differently. Samantha, for example, talked about "mistakes being part of the learning process, responding to those mistakes, trying something differently after you make a mistake. Because you can only learn how to do things by trying and failing and trying and then succeeding—adjusting and then being more successful with whatever it is. . . . I think there is space to be vulnerable." The role that forgiveness and vulnerability can play in caring for oneself speaks to the kinds of attributes that need to accompany the specific self-caring practices one decides to commit to.

While the actual practices one embraces may vary, what can happen is failing to sustain these practices on a regular basis, what I call getting stuck. Barbara, the newly appointed assistant principal, explained her struggles with getting stuck:

> Like last year I meditated every single day of the school year. I got up every morning, I had an app on my phone, and it tracked it, and I had this journal thing I did—every time I meditated I wrote down one word, the first word that came to my head, and I was reading a book about meditation, and I was really into it. All last school year, I literally did it every single day of the school year. And once the summer came, I just stopped. I can't explain why. . . . Same thing with yoga. I would

This content downloaded from 198.082.230.035 on October 13, 2017 13:28:11 PM
All use subject to University of Chicago Press Terms and Conditions (http://www.journals.uchicago.edu/t-and-c).

> go to yoga regularly. I probably started last February, and I was going regularly, and I'd keep it up for awhile and then I'd stop. Or running.

Acknowledging the need to set aside time to care for oneself is an important way of exercising one's autonomy, but actually carving out the time to practice these acts of self-care is a real challenge given the demanding workplace environments aspiring and beginning leaders face. Barbara speaks to these pressures: "There are deadlines, *constantly* deadlines, self-imposed or externally imposed. You're dealing with a lot of mandates from the outside that you're not in control of. And it takes a lot of self-discipline to do that. Especially if you think it's stupid." Barbara's reference to what she calls "self-discipline" is a reminder for those of us educators responsible for cultivating a sense of autonomy and agency in our leadership students that is anchored in the larger purposes of education in/for a democratic society. Self-discipline ought not be equated with complicity, conformity, and obedience. This has important pedagogical implications. It entails helping our leadership students recognize and affirm what self-discipline in the service of caring for oneself means to them. But, further, it calls for discussing ways to structure their day and coming up with options if one's primary way of self-caring proves too difficult to sustain regularly and to one's satisfaction in the face of competing outside pressures and commitments.

Pat had some interesting things to say about how she manages the professional-personal continuum and stays on track with caring for herself. Her use of metaphor provides a rich landscape to help others who struggle, when she says: "I drink from a deep, replenishing well that refreshes my capacity to learn and grow every predictably unpredictable day as a high school administrator." She, too, acknowledges how being a school leader (principal) can cast oneself into the ebb and flow of circumstances not completely of one's choosing.

> We just moved across country, and after being an administrator for three years in New York City, I've become a principal in [another city]. Everything has simultaneously changed and, at the same time, remained the same. At work we'd say it's because of routines and expectations. But since I'm speaking of my home life, my personal life, it's ritual . . . our daily rituals sustain and balance my heart, mind, and spirit. They enable my fierce side, my ambition and work ethic, to flourish and push boundaries while doing my life's work, my calling, which is leading a community of teachers and learners.

This content downloaded from 198.082.230.035 on October 13, 2017 13:28:11 PM
All use subject to University of Chicago Press Terms and Conditions (http://www.journals.uchicago.edu/t-and-c).

Pat says that these rituals (meditation, play, painting, fellowship, rest, playing with the dogs, and, most importantly, her relationship with her husband) "are the anchor to my days." This speaks to the power of ritual in her life to steady and orient her. She helps us see that these self-caring practices, when conducted with purpose and consistency, are essential supports in shaping a meaningful life.

Designing Projects and Creating Spaces for the Development of Educational Leaders That Support Care of the Self

Graduate school educators responsible for the development of educational leaders need to be intentional about how to include care of the self as a central component of leadership. I teach a year-long, site-based research course that culminates in a detailed plan of action that is either implemented or intended to be implemented in the coming school year. I have strong beliefs about the important role such research can play in the development of educational leaders. It situates their learning in their lived professional reality. It puts them in a position where as aspiring or beginning leaders they have to reckon with what they want to see changed and play an active role in seeing happen with a careful consideration of the situation as it presently exists both in terms of anticipated possibilities and entrenched, embedded obstacles. What I had not considered is how this kind of project has implications for care of oneself. For example, Barbara, a student of a colleague who teaches and approaches this course in very much the same way that I do, speaks to how the choice of one's focus of inquiry resonates with her personal concerns and challenges:

> Probably because of all the reading I did for my research last year, stress and stress management and care of self is something that I think about. I was drawn to do that research because as a teacher I thought about it a lot. Because I see the effect of stress on people in my family, and it's something that's personally important to me. I think that to feel effective as a leader, I need to be a person who's healthy, happy, not stressed out, calm, and is growing, is a model of self-reflection and self-growth. And I think that taking care of oneself is all part of that.

While my colleague and I provide ongoing guidance throughout the research study and supply structures and forums for a thorough and systematic study, we also emphasize that problem posing is an important aspect of this work. We make the point that as researchers one should not rush

This content downloaded from 198.082.230.035 on October 13, 2017 13:28:11 PM
All use subject to University of Chicago Press Terms and Conditions (http://www.journals.uchicago.edu/t-and-c).

to judgment and direct one's energies to prematurely solve a problem, that a tolerance for ambiguity is essential to deep understanding, and that personal biases and one's personal stake in the decision of what to study matters. This allows students to cross professional and personal borders and see the interconnectedness of the two. My hope is that the development of professional competency and of responsible leadership and learning how to care for oneself are complementary, not dichotomous, needs.

Samantha helps us to see the implications for leadership development from another perspective. Her yoga practice preceded her study of leadership and work as a beginning leader, but the connections she draws from how she cares for herself through yoga and her professional work are intriguing and noteworthy.

> So I do hot yoga, as you know. The teacher is usually saying things like, drop your head, or let go of your head. Slow, meditative, you breathe, you connect your breath with the body, you are still, you calm your mind, and the teacher is usually saying things that help you to do that. . . . Like having to hold a pose that feels really hard and just kind of breathe through it. Not in a way where if you're actually in any physical pain you would do it, but if it's hard you still hold the pose and just breathe through it. Or breathing into the areas that are tight or hurt in some way and nourishing yourself in that way and just kind of being able to sit with challenges.

Samantha continues, speaking about how her yoga practice supports her work as an assistant principal: "Being able to sit with challenges, working through rough patches and then realizing when they're over. And making that mental shift in your mind that 'I went through the rough patch and I'm on the other side and the rough patch is actually over.' And sometimes I'll even find myself doing the yoga breath during the day to just, when I find things are getting fast, when I find I need to slow down a little I'll do that."

Admittedly, these kinds of personal/professional connections can be more readily accessed, discussed, and developed in my capacity as an advisor. I have biweekly individual meetings with each of my leadership advisees. I meet on a weekly basis with anywhere from five to seven advisees over the course of a full academic year, where discussions are guided by individual and collective concerns and aspirations. This is called conference group. I also visit each of my advisees on a monthly basis in his or her workplace.

This content downloaded from 198.082.230.035 on October 13, 2017 13:28:11 PM
All use subject to University of Chicago Press Terms and Conditions (http://www.journals.uchicago.edu/t-and-c).

In almost all cases, my advisees will also be my students in the research course I discussed earlier. This proves to be an optimal arrangement. The dual roles I play as both course instructor and advisor are mutually reinforcing in this regard. Indeed, advisement accounts for almost half of my professional responsibilities. The development of such spaces is critical if care for the self is to be taken as an essential aspect of leadership development. Along these lines, research on how the cohort model can be designed and conducted to align with how one cares for oneself is strongly recommended.

Carolynn, who was an advisee of mine last year and who is scheduled to take my research course this academic year, spoke to the rewards of advisement group and how the idea of the conference group could be employed in other places that truly value one's professional growth:

> I think that building and engaging consistently with a community of like-minded educators is crucial. Ideally, the community would be a space like conference group, intimate, frequent, and inclusive of diverse perspectives/experiences. Core beliefs about teaching and learning are shared; however, various school settings and professional experiences lend important perspective to conversations. I found great comfort in the perspective provided to me by our [conference] group. It helped me to think outside of the day-to-day realities of my own experience and remind myself why I do and believe in the work that I do.

Bob spoke of conference group as a "good release, cathartic."

It is important to note that there is a consistent and enduring set of core values at my college, which is an institution steeped in the progressive tradition of notable educators such as John Dewey and Lucy Sprague Mitchell, the founder of the college and a contemporary of Dewey's, that provides the context for a pedagogy of caring for oneself. For example, the kinds of questions posed by a former colleague of mine over two decades ago ring true today. They capture how an advisee's ongoing self-reflection both with her advisor on a biweekly basis and with her fellow advisees and advisor in weekly two-hour advisement group meetings made possible a way of understanding leadership development where care for oneself plays a central role.

> How do I feel about and understand the exercising of power? How vulnerable and open to criticism can I afford to be in a position of

This content downloaded from 198.082.230.035 on October 13, 2017 13:28:11 PM
All use subject to University of Chicago Press Terms and Conditions (http://www.journals.uchicago.edu/t-and-c).

> authority and still take responsibility? How do I respond to change, to conflict, to authority? Since so much of my identity is wrapped around being a teacher, who am I in relation to my new, emerging role? How do I nurture the creative capacity of others to take responsibility for the well-being of our educational setting when I, myself, am still unsure of how to proceed as an educational leader? How do certain forms of school governance, organizational structures, reform agendas, etc., affirm and/or challenge my moral and political beliefs, and what is the nature of the risk I take on in deciding to challenge how things operate? (Gaines, as cited in Pignatelli [2000], 222)

These kinds of questions can set the stage for fluid crossing of borders between personal and professional development. In a study I conducted (Pignatelli 2000, 223), the following focusing questions were posed to my former advisees. They provided a useful framework for understanding caring as the weave of personal and professional development and helped to explore the ethical dimension of leadership:

> In your desire to develop as a professional (educational leader), what personal issues or concerns do you recall taking on early, mid-way through, and near the end of advisement? In what ways did advisement help you draw out, clarify, and work on these issues? Looking back on your year of advisement, what insights into yourself emerged? What understandings about yourself deepened and/or changed? Describe a significant personal risk you recall taking on in advisement. How did this personal encounter/reckoning with yourself inform or influence how you regard yourself as a professional (educational leader), how you are with your colleagues, etc.?

Allowing for ongoing dialogues generated from these kinds of questions situates knowing oneself as an act of self-caring. These dialogues can serve to sharpen awareness around self-caring practices as an important way to nourish and inform an aspiring or new leader's development and well-being.

Conclusion

In 2011, a task force of the University Council for Educational Administration (as cited in Buttram [2014]) conducted a national survey of 258 university-based educational leadership doctoral programs (EdD and PhD)

This content downloaded from 198.082.230.035 on October 13, 2017 13:28:11 PM
All use subject to University of Chicago Press Terms and Conditions (http://www.journals.uchicago.edu/t-and-c).

covering 46 states. No mention is made of coursework or clinical experiences focused on ethical leadership. More specifically, there is no recognition of how caring for oneself, in the way I am suggesting in this article, can inform the development of ethical leaders. This seems short-sighted and ill-advised. The pedagogical intervention to cultivate caring for oneself Socrates called for long ago for the young and ambitious Alcibiades went unheeded. The closest this UCEA study comes to identifying the seeds of such a pedagogy of care is its finding that a total of 88% of the EdD programs that define themselves as having gone through a process of redesign since 1991 have a full, partial, or de facto cohort design model. As stated: "Students in these programs are *thought to benefit* from the increased opportunities for camaraderie, peer support, and networking" (3; emphasis added). One is left to wonder what is meant by "thought to benefit." The specifics of what this could or should look like, what the roles and responsibilities of faculty charged with the development of competent, ethical leaders might consist of, are lacking.

So much of what passes for leadership development is situated within a discourse of professionalism that pays little heed to an aspiring leader's relationship to herself and the nourishment of her well-being. Accountability is set in a context of organizational directives and mandates. The aspiring leader is thrown into an environment not of her making, yet wanting and needing to exercise agency. Little or no attention is paid in the development of educational leaders to how or if an aspiring leader manages to care for herself in the midst of (or in spite of) contested environments that present a range of formidable challenges both professionally and personally.

Foucault's movement from his compelling analysis of how power operates in contemporary society and social institutions such as the schools toward the importance of attending to the self's relation to itself as an ethical matter is profoundly important at this moment for educators of aspiring educational leaders to consider and, hopefully, embrace. I believe it warrants being an integral dimension of leadership development. Foucault restores and affirms, as did Socrates before him, a notion of accountability as being accountable to oneself. He goes further. By tracing, describing, and analyzing modes of caring for oneself practiced in the distant past, he challenges us to do the same at this present moment in time. He provides a needed provocation for us educators and for those we care for to identify and, most importantly, enact and sustain a commitment to those self-caring

This content downloaded from 198.082.230.035 on October 13, 2017 13:28:11 PM
All use subject to University of Chicago Press Terms and Conditions (http://www.journals.uchicago.edu/t-and-c).

practices that fortify our capacity to shape ourselves as ethical subjects in environments that grow increasingly regulated. In this way, we give ourselves a chance to become artists of our own lives.

References

Brion, Fabienne, and Bernard E. Harcourt. 2014. *Wrong-Doing, Truth-Telling: The Function of Avowal in Justice*. Chicago: University of Chicago Press.

Buttram, Joan. 2014. "Survey of EdD and PhD Educational Leadership Programs." *UCEA Review* 55 (2): 1–6.

Foucault, Michel. 1980. "Two Lectures: Lecture 1, 7 January 1976." In *Power/Knowledge: Selected Interviews and Other Writings, 1972–1977*, ed. and trans. Colin Gordon. New York: Pantheon Books.

Foucault, Michel. 1987. "The Ethic of Care for the Self as a Practice of Freedom: An Interview with Michel Foucault on January 20, 1984." *Philosophy and Social Criticism* 12 (2–3): 112–31.

Foucault, Michel. 1988. *Technologies of the Self: A Seminar with Michel Foucault*, ed. Luther H. Martin, Huck Gutman, and Patrick H. Hutton. Amherst: University of Massachusetts Press.

Foucault, Michel. 1997. "Self Writing." In *Michel Foucault: Ethics: Subjectivity and Truth*, ed. Paul Rabinow. New York: New Press.

Foucault, Michel. 2005. *The Hermeneutics of the Subject: Lectures at the College de France, 1981–1982*, ed. Frédéric Gros and trans. Graham Burcell. New York: Picador.

Pignatelli, Frank. 2000. "Furthering a Progressive Agenda: Advisement and the Development of Educators." In *Revisiting a Progressive Pedagogy: The Developmental-Interaction Approach*, ed. Nancy Nager and Edna K. Shapiro. Albany, NY: SUNY Press.

Schuld, J. Joyce. 2003. *Foucault and Augustine: Reconsidering Power and Love*. Notre Dame, IN: University of Notre Dame Press.

This content downloaded from 198.082.230.035 on October 13, 2017 13:28:11 PM
All use subject to University of Chicago Press Terms and Conditions (http://www.journals.uchicago.edu/t-and-c).